2023 NYC HOUSING TRACKER REPORT

Every neighborhood must help solve the city's affordable housing crisis

The NYC Housing Tracker monitors affordable housing production data in New York City by City Council district. New York Housing Conference has updated the Tracker to include production in the first full year of Mayor Eric Adams's administration – calendar year 2022- in which the city produced just 14,766 units of affordable housing, including construction of new housing and preservation of existing housing. This is a 48 percent decrease from the average over the previous five years, which was 28,387 units.

Last year, Mayor Eric Adams launched NYC's housing plan - Housing Our Neighbors: A Blueprint for Housing and Homelessness - a framework for investment of \$22 billion in affordable housing development and preservation across the five boroughs over the next decade. He also launched the City of Yes, a zoning framework to make all

NYC neighborhoods part of the housing plan. In addition, the Mayor set a "moonshot" goal of adding 500k housing units over the next decade and the <u>Mayor's Management Report</u> sets the affordable housing production goals associated with the fiscal year 2023 budget at 18,000 units.

At the same time as production is plummeting New York is experiencing a severe housing crisis. NYC's emergency shelters house more than 80,000 people experiencing homelessness. Nearly one million New Yorkers were rent burdened in 2021 and nearly 600,000 were severely rent burdened. Rents have increased more than 9 percent over the past year as renters compete for the same limited number of available apartments with a vacancy rate of only 4.5 percent. Statewide we have a deficit of almost 650,000 available rental units affordable for households earning roughly \$50,000 or less.

NEW CONSTRUCTION

In 2022, the city produced 8,935 units of affordable housing through new construction, 7 percent less than the average over the previous five years (9,606 units). The decrease in production can be attributed to staffing shortages that began before Mayor Adams took office. While there has been some improvement in adding staff, shortages continue to negatively impact production. As of March, HPD had 400 fewer positions than budgeted (15% shortage) and 123 fewer staff than before the pandemic (5% staff loss).

thenyhc.org @thenyhc 1

NEW CONSTRUCTION BY COUNCIL DISTRICT

The NYC Housing Tracker focuses on production by City Council district in order to spotlight where new affordable housing is getting built in NYC. City Council members have an important role to play in land use approvals and each approval makes a difference as analysis of 2022 production shows. Data from 2014 – 2022 shows that affordable housing production continues to be unequally spread across the city. During that time, 16 districts produced more than 2,000 units of new affordable housing – mostly in neighborhoods in the South Bronx, Central Brooklyn, East River waterfront in Brooklyn and Queens, and Southeast Queens. Meanwhile, 17 districts produced fewer than 400 units over that time, with nine districts producing less than 200 units over the nine years. 18 districts produced between 400 units and 1,999 units.

RANK	DISTRICT	2014-2022
1	17	9,019
2	42	6,029
3	8	5,633
4	33	4,731
5	15	3,474
6	26	3,246
7	37	3,093
8	35	3,063
9	31	2,886
10	14	2,740
11	16	2,636
12	3	2,515
13	27	2,433
14	41	2,211
15	34	2,040
16	11	2,017
17	36	1,839
18	40	1,700
19	9	1,635
20	18	1,526
21	47	1,523
22	1	1,435
23	24	1,017
24	6	923
25	10	796
26	22	700

RANK	DISTRICT	2014-2022
27	39	698
28	49	659
29	45	657
30	5	633
31	29	536
32	12	508
33	4	483
34	7	450
35	2	386
36	20	288
37	48	263
38	30	252
39	21	251
40	38	241
41	28	240
42	50	201
43	44	168
44	32	134
45	43	118
46	25	101
47	13	95
48	51	51
49	23	49
50*	19	48
50*	46	48

^{*} These districts are tied for 50th because they produced the same number of units.

The Tracker ranks districts based on affordable housing production from 2014 – 2022. **The top ten producing districts are:**

RANK	DISTRICT	COUNCIL MEMBER	2014-2022
1	17	Rafael Salamanca	9,019
2	42	Charles Barron	6,029
3	8	Diana Ayala	5,633
4	33	Lincoln Restler	4,731
5	15	Oswald Feliz	3,474
6	26	Julie Won	3,246
7	37	Sandy Nurse	3,093
8	35	Crystal Hudson	3,063
9	31	Selvena N. Brooks-Powers	2,886
10	14	Pierina Ana Sanchez	2,740

The districts that produced the fewest number of affordable housing units from 2014 – 2022 were:

RANK	DISTRICT	COUNCIL MEMBER	2014-2022
50*	46	Mercedes Narcisse	48
50*	19	Vickie Paladino	48
49	23	Linda Lee	49
48	51	Joseph Borelli	51
47	13	Marjorie Velazquez	95
46	25	Shekar Krishnan	101
45	43	Justin Brannan	118
44	32	Joann Ariola	134
43	44	Kalman Yeger	168
42	50	David Carr	201

^{*} These districts are tied for 50th because they produced the same number of units.

The data is from 2014 – 2022, which includes years when the current Council member was not in the City Council. Seeing where affordable housing has been produced allows us to advocate for where to continue to develop and where to expand efforts to add more affordable housing.

The disparities in affordable housing construction are due to multiple factors. Low production of affordable housing is often due to low-density zoning and opposition from elected officials and community residents to affordable housing. High production can typically occur in neighborhoods with lower land costs and medium- to high-density zoning or higher-cost neighborhoods with medium- to high-density zoning incentivized with zoning and tax benefits.

Looking just at 2022 – the first year of Mayor Eric Adams's administration – there were 8,935 units of new affordable housing produced, 175 units per district. The disparities in affordable housing production remain as we continue to see more affordable housing production in central Brooklyn, the Bronx, northern Manhattan, and Southeast Queens. Affordable housing production through Mandatory Inclusionary Housing coupled with the 421a tax incentive made some high-cost Brooklyn districts top producers as well. Looking at just one year of production, it is clear just how important individual housing projects are.

Each project that gets approved and financed makes a difference. One or two bigger projects or several smaller projects can make a district a leader in production and add valuable housing to the neighborhood and the city.

Top 10 New Construction 2022

DISTRICT	COUNCIL MEMBER	2022
37	Sandy Nurse	1,056
42	Charles Barron	774
14	Pierina Ana Sanchez	680
33	Lincoln Restler	588
17	Rafael Salamanca	525
8	Diana Ayala	460
39	Shahana Hanif	445
41	Darlene Mealy	405
10	Carmen De La Rosa	350
11	Eric Dinowitz	335

Bottom 10 New Construction 2022

COUNCIL MEMBER	2014-2022
Carlina Rivera	0
David Carr	1
Justin Brannan	1
Vickie Paladino	1
Keith Powers	1
Joseph Borelli	2
Robert Holden	2
Adrienne Adams	3
Gale Brewer	3
Shaun Abreu	5
	Carlina Rivera David Carr Justin Brannan Vickie Paladino Keith Powers Joseph Borelli Robert Holden Adrienne Adams Gale Brewer

Single units of affordable housing new construction include downpayment assistance program units.

PRESERVATION

The decrease in affordable housing production was more pronounced in the city's efforts to preserve affordable housing. This was largely due to insufficient staff to manage preservation projects. In 2022, HPD preserved just 5,831 units of affordable housing, 69% less than the average over the previous five years, when the city preserved 18,780 units per year on average. This decrease is dramatic and means the city is missing opportunities to support repairs and/or extend affordable housing.

According to data from the **NYU Furman Center**, 59,502 units of housing have affordability programs expiring over the next five years, including buildings with J-51 or 421a tax benefits, in the Mitchell Lama and Project-Based Section 8 programs, with Low Income Housing Tax Credits, and other HUD programs. The expiring units data does not show all units in HPD's preservation pipeline and not all of these units will be candidates to be preserved. For example, some projects with expiring J-51 benefits will continue to be regulated by other HPD affordable housing programs. Tax benefits expiring in the 421a programs have produced thousands of units of affordable housing and some of those units will continue to be rent stabilized after the benefit expires.

But the data is a good starting point to see thousands of expiring units in Project-Based Section 8, Mitchell Lama, Low Income Housing Tax Credits and other HUD and HPD programs that may need subsidy or a tax abatement to be preserved. Updates to HPD's loan authority- to update loan terms, per unit subsidy caps and other lending parameters- through State legislation will be critical to this effort. The districts with the greatest number of these expiring units are Districts 1, 2, 3, 5, 7, and 9 in Manhattan, Districts 8 and 15 in central and southern Bronx, and Districts 36, 41 and 42 in central Brooklyn which all have more than 600 units expiring from their affordability requirements in the next five years (excluding 421a and J-51 programs).

Affordable Program	Expiring Units: 2023-2027	
J-51	26,465	
Project-Based Section 8	13,178	
421a	7,761	
HUD Programs	4,742	
Mitchell-Lama	3,680	
LIHTC	3,513	
421g	163	
Grand Total	59,502	

Another key metric for examining preservation needs is <u>code enforcement data</u>. Preservation financing programs can be used to support repairs and major building upgrades in affordable and market-rate buildings. Over the past two years, housing code complaints and violations <u>have increased dramatically</u>, with complaints increasing 39 percent and violations increasing 54 percent, showing a need for increased enforcement, monitoring of housing quality and preservation resources. The districts with the most housing violations relative to the number of housing units in the district are Districts 9 and 10 in northern Manhattan, Districts 14, 15, 16, and 17 in the South Bronx, and Districts 40 and 41 in central Brooklyn.

Preservation of affordable housing units ensures that affordable units which restrict rents by income according to a regulatory agreement remain affordable to existing and future tenants. The threat of losing these units to market forces at the end of a regulatory period in high-rent neighborhoods is high. Preservation can also be important for buildings that need funding for repairs - this can apply to existing affordable housing in any neighborhood or rental housing in need of low-interest financing or a tax abatement like J-51 to offset the costs of residential rehabilitation while keeping rents down. The dramatic spike in maintenance code complaints and violations demonstrates a need for incentives to invest in housing preservation.

PRESERVATION BY COUNCIL DISTRICT

Most Council districts saw fewer units preserved in 2022 than they had on average from 2014-2022. In some areas the change was very pronounced. The four Council districts in lower Manhattan – Districts 1-4 – saw no affordable housing preserved in 2022 while they saw hundreds of units preserved each year on average from 2014-2021. While demand for preservation financing needs is not easily discerned through available data, it is possible that opportunities to preserve important affordable housing is being delayed or missed.

The same is true in Districts 16, 17 and 18 in the South Bronx where nearly 2,000 units were preserved each year on average from 2014-2021 but in 2022 only 771 units were preserved. And in Southeast Queens and Central Brooklyn (Districts 31-36) where 1,900 units were preserved each year on average, just 968 units were preserved in 2022. But perhaps the starkest example is District 42 in Central Brooklyn including East New York, New Lots, Remsen Village, Spring Creek, Starrett City, where nearly 1,200 units were preserved each year from 2014 – 2021 but in 2022 only 26 units were preserved.

CONCLUSION

New York City still has a long way to go to producing affordable housing equitably throughout the city. At present, the city invests subsidies to build in low-income communities while leveraging the market in high-income neighborhoods, dependent on state legislated tax benefits. These dual strategies are only effective in medium- to high-density areas and the city will need to look to other ways to bring affordable housing to low-density communities. And each Council member will need to support projects in their district.

But the city cannot neglect preserving affordable housing, which has declined dramatically during the first year of Mayor Eric Adams's administration. Code violations are increasing, highlighting the need for financial support to ensure quality housing. Thousands of affordable housing buildings are getting close to the end of their regulatory periods and will need ways to extend their affordability. The city must ensure they have the staff and resources to increase production.

thenyhc.org @thenyhc 6

NEW CONSTRUCTION OF AFFORDABLE HOUSING: 2014-2022

RANK 2014-2022	DISTRICT	COUNCIL MEMBER	CY 2014-2021	CY 2022	TOTAL 2014-2022
1	17	Rafael Salamanca	8,494	525	9,019
2	42	Charles Barron	5,255	774	6,029
3	8	Diana Ayala	5,173	460	5,633
4	33	Lincoln Restler	4,143	588	4,731
5	15	Oswald Feliz	3,244	230	3,474
6	26	Julie Won	3,139	107	3,246
7	37	Sandy Nurse	2,037	1,056	3,093
8	35	Crystal Hudson	2,945	118	3,063
9	31	Selvena N. Brooks-Powers	2,589	297	2,886
10	14	Pierina Ana Sanchez	2,060	680	2,740
11	16	Althea Stevens	2,525	111	2,636
12	3	Erik Bottcher	2,303	212	2,515
13	27	Nantasha Williams	2,313	120	2,433
14	41	Darlene Mealy	1,806	405	2,211
15	34	Jennifer Gutiérrez	1,925	115	2,040
16	11	Eric Dinowitz	1,682	335	2,017
17	36	Chi Ossé	1,577	262	1,839
18	40	Rita Joseph	1,567	133	1,700
19	9	Kristin Richardson Jordan	1,356	279	1,635
20	18	Amanda Farías	1,353	173	1,526
21	47	Ari Kagan	1,506	17	1,523
22	1	Christopher Marte	1,177	258	1,435
23	24	James Gennaro	998	19	1,017
24	6	Gale Brewer	920	3	923
25	10	Carmen De La Rosa	446	350	796

RANK 2014-2022	DISTRICT	COUNCIL MEMBER	CY 2014-2021	CY 2022	TOTAL 2014-2022
26	22	Tiffany Cabán	601	99	700
27	39	Shahana Hanif	253	445	698
28	49	Kamillah Hanks	640	19	659
29	45	Farah Louis	442	215	657
30	5	Julie Menin	619	14	633
31	29	Lynn Schulman	503	33	536
32	12	Kevin Riley	363	145	508
33	4	Keith Powers	482	1	483
34	7	Shaun Abreu	445	5	450
35	2	Carlina Rivera	386	0	386
36	20	Sandra Ung	279	9	288
37	48	Inna Vernikov	242	21	263
38	30	Robert Holden	250	2	252
39	21	Francisco Moya	160	91	251
40	38	Alexa Avilés	220	21	241
41	28	Adrienne Adams	237	3	240
42	50	David Carr	200	1	201
43	44	Kalman Yeger	119	49	168
44	32	Joann Ariola	116	18	134
45	43	Justin Brannan	117	1	118
46	25	Shekar Krishnan	82	19	101
47	13	Marjorie Velazquez	71	24	95
48	51	Joseph Borelli	49	2	51
49	23	Linda Lee	17	32	49
50*	19	Vickie Paladino	47	1	48
50*	46	Mercedes Narcisse	41	7	48

^{*} These districts are tied for 50th because they produced the same number of units.

PRESERVATION OF AFFORDABLE HOUSING: 2014-2022

DISTRICT	COUNCIL MEMBER	UNITS PRESERVED CY 2014-2021	UNITS PRESERVED CY 2022	TOTAL UNITS PRESERVED 2014-2022
1	Christopher Marte	3,872	0	3,872
2	Carlina Rivera	4,152	0	4,152
3	Erik Bottcher	3,360	0	3,360
4	Keith Powers	5,620	0	5,620
5	Julie Menin	783	132	915
6	Gale Brewer	1,652	523	2,175
7	Shaun Abreu	2,526	800	3,326
8	Diana Ayala	9,195	279	9,474
9	Kristin Richardson Jordan	12,054	244	12,298
10	Carmen De La Rosa	1,103	38	1,141
11	Eric Dinowitz	1,988	126	2,114
12	Kevin Riley	16,191	142	16,333
13	Marjorie Velazquez	377	5	382
14	Pierina Ana Sanchez	4,384	277	4,661
15	Oswald Feliz	3,565	746	4,311
16	Althea Stevens	6,328	225	6,553
17	Rafael Salamanca	7,948	541	8,489
18	Amanda Farías	2,609	5	2,614
19	Vickie Paladino	3	2	5
20	Sandra Ung	56	0	56
21	Francisco Moya	449	207	656
22	Tiffany Cabán	739	1	740
23	Linda Lee	5	2	7
24	James Gennaro	2,295	383	2,678
25	Shekar Krishnan	0	0	0

DISTRICT	COUNCIL MEMBER	UNITS PRESERVED CY 2014-2021	UNITS PRESERVED CY 2022	TOTAL UNITS PRESERVED 2014-2022
26	Julie Won	981	20	1,001
27	Nantasha Williams	212	14	226
28	Adrienne Adams	6,224	10	6,234
29	Lynn Schulman	482	1	483
30	Robert Holden	87	2	89
31	Selvena N. Brooks-Powers	3,081	10	3,091
32	Joann Ariola	1,527	1	1,528
33	Lincoln Restler	1,019	579	1,598
34	Jennifer Gutiérrez	3,953	0	3,953
35	Crystal Hudson	2,841	366	3,207
36	Chi Ossé	2,948	12	2,960
37	Sandy Nurse	437	2	439
38	Alexa Avilés	930	48	978
39	Shahana Hanif	197	0	197
40	Rita Joseph	459	8	467
41	Darlene Mealy	3,249	18	3,267
42	Charles Barron	9,679	26	9,705
43	Justin Brannan	274	0	274
44	Kalman Yeger	254	0	254
45	Farah Louis	29	8	37
46	Mercedes Narcisse	79	16	95
47	Ari Kagan	1,698	0	1,698
48	Inna Vernikov	1,396	0	1,396
49	Kamillah Hanks	2,052	9	2,061
50	David Carr	187	1	188
51	Joseph Borelli	7	0	7